

2024 Bargaining Unit 1 Recruitment and Retention Committee Report

Executive Summary:

This report is a product of the Recruitment and Retention Committee established by Article 5.17.1, of the parties' Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), in which the parties agreed to meet on an annual basis to discuss the recruitment and retention issues of Bargaining Unit 1 classifications.

This report is the culmination of the hard work of the committee and represents a comprehensive review of the following classifications and their associated series:

- Accountant I (Specialist)
- Associate Tax Auditor
- Disability Evaluation Analyst III
- Field Examiner I, Agricultural Labor Relations Board
- Health Program Auditor III, Department of Health Care Service
- Hearing Reporter
- Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), Department of Justice
- Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Specialist)
- Research Data Specialist II
- Senior Insurance Rate Analyst

Overall, the committee is recommending a salary study be conducted at the classification level for market rate and equity as several of the classifications have demonstrated a lag behind either private, local or federal competitors in their specific labor market. This report is organized by classification.

Each section will review the classification description, the series description and associated classification schematic group, and pay scales. Each section will detail the 2024 labor market information available to the committee and will discuss any challenges and solutions identified by the committee.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Purpose:.....	5
Information Reviewed:.....	5
Meeting Dates:	5
Committee Members:	5
Union Representatives:	5
Union Representatives Subject Matter Experts (SME):	6
State Representatives:	6
Classification Overviews and Recommendations	7
Accountant I (Specialist).....	7
Series Description:	7
Series Composition:	7
Position Information and Employment Data:	8
Issues:.....	8
Recommendation:	9
Tax Auditor Series.....	10
Series Description:	10
Series Composition:	11
Position Information and Employment Data:	12
Issues:.....	14
Recommendations:	14
Disability Evaluation Analyst Series	15
Series Description:	15
Series Composition:	15
Position Information and Employment Data:	16
Issues:.....	17
Recommendations:	17
Field Examiner, Agricultural Labor Relations Board Series	18
Series Description:	18
Series Composition:	18
Position Information and Employment Data:	18

Issues:.....	19
Recommendations:	19
Health Program Auditor, Department of Health Care Services Series	20
Series Description:	20
Series Composition:	21
Position Information and Employment Data:	22
Issues:.....	23
Recommendation:	24
Hearing Reporter	25
Series Description:	25
Series Composition:	25
Position Information and Employment Data:	26
Issues:.....	26
Recommendation:	27
Investigative Auditor Series	28
Series Description:	28
Series Composition:	28
Position Information and Employment Data:	29
Issues:.....	30
Recommendation:	31
Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Specialist)	32
Series Description:	32
Series Composition:	32
Position Information and Employment Data:	33
Issues:.....	30
Recommendation:	31
Research Data Series	35
Series Description:	35
Series Composition:	35
Position Information and Employment Data:	37
Issues:.....	38
Recommendation:	38

Senior Insurance Rate Analyst	39
Series Description:	39
Series Composition:	39
Position Information and Employment Data:	40
Issues:.....	41
Recommendation:	41

Purpose:

In accordance with the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) Article 5.17.1, the State agrees to establish a Recruitment and Retention Committee that shall meet on an annual basis to discuss the recruitment and retention issues of Bargaining Unit 1 classifications. The Committee shall consist of ten (10) members: five (5) selected by the State and five (5) selected by the Union.

Committee members or expert witnesses required by the Committee shall serve without loss of compensation. The Committee shall review no more than ten (10) classifications annually. The review shall include a comparison of compensation (e.g. salary, other pay items, compensated leave, health benefits, pension benefits, and retiree health benefits) as well as vacancy rates (both historical and current). If the Committee agrees that pay equity adjustments are recommended for the effective recruitment and retention of classifications, the State and the Union shall mutually report their findings to the Director of the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR). The Director of CalHR shall report these findings to the administration.

Information Reviewed:

According to Government Code section 19826(a) and (c), when the state establishes or adjusts salaries, "consideration shall be given to the prevailing rates for comparable service in other public employment and in private business." The committee reviewed available data from the Federal Department of Labor, the Employment Development Department Labor Market Information Division, and California State Controller's, private and public job posting, and salary survey data.

Meeting Dates:

August 28, 2024

August 29, 2024

September 19, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 17, 2024

March 3, 2025

Committee Members:

Union Representatives:

Susan Rodriguez, Chair of Unit 1, State Fund

Mike Ramos, Vice Chair of Unit 1, Lottery

Vincent Green, Alternate Vice Chair of Unit 1, CalVet

Carolyn Alluis, DIR

Karen DeVoll, CDCR

Frank Askin, CUIAB
Gina Crawford, CalPERS
Eddie Isaacs, DOT
Cristen Harrington, DIR
Mary Hunkins, DHCS
Matt Montgomery, CDCR
Lynne Mosely, CPUC
Joanne Silverstrom, EDD
Angela Williams, EDD
Joshua Zelman, EDD
Cathy Reabold, DSH

Union Representatives Subject Matter Experts (SME):

Marissa Meza-Coronado, Accountant I, CDCR
Trevor McCormick, Associate Tax Auditor, CDTFA
Mary Hinton, Disability Evaluation Analyst III, DSS
Grace Esparza, Field Examiner I, ALRB
Mandy Ho, Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS
Natasha Kaupanger-Swacker, Hearing Reporter, DIR
Christian Reyes, Investigative Auditor IV, DOJ
Wilson Muzhuthettu, General Auditor III, CSLC
Gina Crawford, Research Program Specialist II, CalPERS
Carolyn Yap, Senior Insurance Rate Analyst, CDI

State Representatives:

Jeff Keil, Labor Relations Officer, CalHR
Briana Misiewicz, Labor Relations Specialist, EDD
Michelle Seifried, Labor Relations Officer, ALRB
Elizabeth Esau, Labor Relations Officer, CDI
Atizza Tuazon, Labor Relations Specialist, SCIF
Fermin Perez, Labor Relations Manager I, DHCS
Julie Morgan, Labor Relations Officer, CalPERS
Jorrell Sorensen, Director of Employee Relations, SCIF
Darlene Hayashi, Labor Relations Officer, CSLC
Eva Binder, Labor Relations Specialist, DSS
Dominic Sogliuzzo, Labor Relations Specialist, DSS
Steve Satake, Labor Relations Officer, FTB
Sabrina Harun, Labor Relations Specialist, FTB
Adriana Freelin, Labor Relations Specialist, DOJ
Mark Magee, Labor Relations Manager, CDTFA

Classification Overviews and Recommendations

Accountant I (Specialist)

Series Description:

The Accountant I (Specialist) classification performs the more difficult semi-professional accounting work in the establishment and maintenance of accounts and records for specialized agency activities, departmental systems, and for central fiscal control activities; Further, the classification performs maintenance of a segment of an accounting function for a State department (e.g., accounts receivable, accounts payable, cash disbursements), and may do other related work.

Incumbents perform a variety of activities in many specialized areas, including: makes journal entries, posts ledgers, takes trial balances, audits claims, and performs preliminary reconciliations and adjustments of financial records and reports; gathers data for a variety of financial reports requiring the application of accounting principles and judgment; compiles the less difficult financial reports; compiles and analyzes workload and other budget data; reviews deposit receipts submitted by field offices; prepares remittance advise to the State Controller's Office; keeps track of interest due on stocks, bonds and other securities; maintains follow-up and collection of dishonored checks; prepares and/or reviews invoices for contracts, interagency agreements, and billings by the department; issues invoices to departmental employees for overpayment or misuse of departmental equipment; maintains unclear collection account; makes progress payments to contractors on a monthly basis based on work completed by the contractor; and reviews and schedules payment for leases for office space and consultant contracts.

The Accountant I (Specialist) may have ongoing contact with program managers, field office cashiers, accounting control and cost accounting sections; and may have some contact with control agencies, local governmental jurisdictions, and Federal Government employees.

Series Composition:

The series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Accountant I (Specialist)	JL32	4177

The Accountant I (Specialist) is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Financial, which covers:

Schematic Group	Schematic Code
------------------------	-----------------------

General Auditing and Financial Examinations	JA00
Public Utility Rates and Examinations	JG00
Tax Administration and Auditing	JH00
State Controller's Office	JK00
Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control	JL00
Specialized Financial Staff Services	JR00
Financial Planning and Investments	JV00

Salary Rates

Accountant I (Specialist)

Min - Max

\$3,819 – \$4,780 (Rg. A)

\$3,933 – \$4,925 (Rg. L)

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancy rate stands at 30.7%, which is 14.3% higher than the overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate of 16.4%. The classification trends demonstrate a higher voluntary separation rate over the overall bargaining unit at 4.1% compared to the 2.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average. Employer data also shows the Accountant I (Specialist) maintains a marginally higher 3-year average retirement rate of 2.9% percent compared to the Bargaining Unit 1 3-year average rate of 2.8% percent. The classification carries a 7.7% average turnover rate, which is higher than the 5.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average.

The Accountant I (Specialist) classification's average time in civil service is approximately 8 years, which is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, an Accountant I (Specialist) who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group receives approximately 4.6% more than local government, 8% more than private, and lags the Federal government by 23.3%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 2.9% more than local government, 3.7% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 19.5%, indicating positive salary growth overall.

Issues:

The Accountant I (Specialist) minimum qualifications require 12 semester hours of a professional accounting curriculum. However, the wage rate for the Accounting I (Specialist) is similar or lower than other classifications which are entry level into state service and require only a twelfth-grade education or equivalent, without specialization. The low comparison in wages impacts recruitment efforts to fill vacant positions.

Promotional opportunities within the accounting and financial management series are limited because of educational requirements for advancement. The minimum qualifications in the accounting and financial management series require either graduation in higher education with a degree in accounting or completion of multiple semester units focused on accounting, auditing, and business law. These requirements impact advancement by requiring completion of specialized education classes or graduation in lieu of state service experience in the classification.

Recommendation:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Review Classification Specification and Minimum Qualifications with a focus on reducing barriers for entry into the classification series.

Increase career development, training, and learning and development opportunities.

Tax Auditor Series

Series Description:

The Associate Tax Auditor classification is utilized by the following three departments:

- Board of Equalization/Department of Tax and Fee Administration
- Employment Development Department
- Franchise Tax Board

In general, Tax Auditors perform professional auditing work in accordance with departmental audit standards, and to assure compliance with the tax program. The specific duties of the classification are dependent upon the department they are employed at.

Board of Equalization/Department of Tax and Fee Administration:

Tax Auditors either: (1) conduct field audits of taxpayers' accounting books and records, using generally accepted auditing standards and procedures to ensure correct reporting of business taxes; or (2) perform audit-related functions in Headquarters. Supervising Tax Auditors I, II, and III either: (1) plan, direct, and evaluate the work of an audit crew, unit, or program; or (2) in the Hearing Section of the Legal Section, conduct informal tax hearings. The Principal Tax Auditor manages the State Board of Equalization's business taxes audit programs.

Employment Development Department:

Performs professional auditing work in accordance with departmental audit standards, and to assure compliance with the tax program provisions of California's Unemployment, Disability Insurance, and Personal Income Tax Withholding laws. The Tax Auditor may as assigned: conduct uniform audits and investigations of employer records; perform special and complex assignments related to the field audit or investigation; determine and obtain compliance with tax laws; develop and interpret tax auditing and compliance procedures; interpret and apply provisions of the California Unemployment Insurance Code, California Code of Regulations, Title 22, California Labor Code, and California Unemployment Insurance Appeals Board decisions for assigned benefit and wage investigations; or apply provisions of the Internal Revenue Code and other California Codes, e.g., Revenue and Taxation Code, Business and Professions Code, etc., as they relate to the programs administered by the Employment Development Department.

Franchise Tax Board:

Tax Auditors either: (1) conduct office or field audits to determine tax liability under provisions of California's Personal Income Tax and Bank and Corporation Tax Laws; or (2) perform audit-related functions in the Central Office.

Series Composition:

Board of Equalization/Department of Tax and Fee Administration:

The Tax Auditor, Board of Equalization Series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Tax Auditor, Board of Equalization	4267	JH53
Associate Tax Auditor, Board of Equalization	4281	JH50
Supervising Tax Auditor I, Board of Equalization	4280	JH40
Supervising Tax Auditor II, Board of Equalization	4277	JH30
Supervising Tax Auditor III, Board of Equalization	4271	JH20

The salary rates are as follows:

Classification	Salary Rates
Tax Auditor, Board of Equalization	\$4,558 – \$5,993 (Rg. A) \$5,636 – \$7,410 (Rg. B)
Associate Tax Auditor, Board of Equalization	\$6,452 – \$8,458
Supervising Tax Auditor I, Board of Equalization	\$7,821 – \$10,275
Supervising Tax Auditor II, Board of Equalization	\$8,206 – \$10,790
Supervising Tax Auditor III, Board of Equalization	\$9,466 – \$12,440

Employment Development Department:

The Tax Auditor, Employment Development Department Series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Tax Auditor, Employment Development Department	4336	JJ49
Associate Tax Auditor, Emp. Development Department	4339	JJ40
Staff Tax Auditor, Employment Development Department	4280	JH40

The salary rates are as follows:

Classification	Salary Rates
Tax Auditor, Employment Development Department	\$4,558 – \$5,993 (Rg. A)
	\$5,636 – \$7,410 (Rg. B)
Associate Tax Auditor, Emp. Development Department	\$6,452 – \$8,458
Staff Tax Auditor, Employment Development Department	\$7,091 – \$9,319

Franchise Tax Board:

The Tax Auditor, Franchise Tax Board Series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Tax Auditor, Franchise Tax Board	4362	JI61
Associate Tax Auditor, Franchise Tax Board	4361	JI50

The salary rates are as follows:

Classification	Salary Rates
Tax Auditor, Franchise Tax Board	\$4,558 – \$5,993 (Rg. A)
	\$5,636 – \$7,410 (Rg. B)
Associate Tax Auditor, Franchise Tax Board	\$6,452 – \$8,458

The Tax Auditor series is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Financial, which covers:

Schematic Group	Schematic Code
General Auditing and Financial Examinations	JA00
Public Utility Rates and Examinations	JG00
Tax Administration and Auditing	JH00
State Controller's Office	JK00
Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control	JL00
Specialized Financial Staff Services	JR00
Financial Planning and Investments	JV00

[Position Information and Employment Data:](#)

Associate Tax Auditor vacancies vary by department:

Department	Established	Vacant	Vacancy Rate
Board of Equalization/Department of Tax and Fee Administration	498	182	38%
Employment Development Department	120	27	23.9%
Franchise Tax Board	179	37	17%

Further, the voluntary separation, turnover, and retirement rates vary by department:

Department	Voluntary Separation	Turnover	Retirement
Board of Equalization/Department of Tax and Fee Administration	2.3%	4.1%	1.7%
Employment Development Department	1.4%	5.1%	3.4%
Franchise Tax Board	5.0%	8.1%	2.9%
Average of three Departments	2.9%	5.8%	2.7%

The classification trends demonstrate a higher vacancy rate than the 16.4% Bargaining Unit 1 average, and a higher voluntary separation rate compared to the 2.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average. Employer data also shows the classification maintains a lower 3-year average Retirement rate of 2.67% percent compared to the overall 3-year Bargaining Unit 1 average rate of 2.8% percent. The classification carries a 5.77% average turnover rate, which is marginally higher than the 5.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average.

The average time in civil service varies by department:

Department	Average Time in Civil Service
Board of Equalization	13 years
Employment Development Department	13 years
Franchise Tax Board	10 years
Average of three Departments	12 years

The average time in civil service for the Associate Tax Auditor is approximately 12 years, which is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, an Associate Tax Auditor who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 6 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report this occupational group receives approximately 4.6% more than local government, 8% more than private, and lags the Federal government by 23.3%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 2.9% more than local government, 3.7% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 19.5%, indicating positive salary growth overall.

Issues:

The Associate Tax Auditor classification is a journey level position which is experiencing a wage rate below comparable wages with federal government employee classifications with similar minimum qualification requirements. Geographical areas with high costs of living impacts recruitment for qualified candidates in these areas. One required duty of the Associate Tax Auditor is to travel into the field and perform on-site audits at taxpayer locations. It is operationally necessary to recruit candidates who reside within or near the county's where audits are conducted. It has become increasingly difficult to recruit and retain staff due to the high cost of living in identifiable areas. Vacancy rates in these areas may exceed 40%.

More demanding duties are required to be performed based on program and department. Auditors employed with the Department of Tax and Fee Administration frequently travel to a variety of businesses to carry out their duties. The varied environments in which the work is performed are not typical with other Associate Tax Auditors in other departments.

Recommendations:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Consider providing department specific recruitment and retention incentives to recognize increased skill and/or knowledge/certifications that may be needed for the position.

Disability Evaluation Analyst Series

Series Description:

The Disability Evaluation Analyst series specification describes three class levels within the Disability and Adult Programs Division at the Department of Social Services. Positions in these classes are involved in obtaining and analyzing medical, personal, and vocational information in the adjudication of claims for disability benefits under Title II (Disability Insurance), Title XVI (Supplemental Security Income), and Title XIX (Medically Needy Medi-Cal) of the Social Security Act. Incumbents in this series are also responsible for Residual Functional Capacity preparation and for analyzing vocational factors requiring complete knowledge of jobs and the transferability of vocational skills from one job to another; performing quasi-judicial reappraisals for final determination of claims for reconsideration or continuing disability; training other professional staff; performing division support and program service functions; analyzing and resolving program support need; investigating problem areas; gathering, compiling, and displaying data; designing and conducting studies and analyzing the findings; and recommending new equipment, procedures, or approaches.

Series Composition:

The classification series is composed of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Disability Evaluation Analyst	KH46	5365
Disability Evaluation Analyst II	KH44	8392
Disability Evaluation Analyst III	KH42	5367

The Disability Evaluation Analyst is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Health Administration.

Salary Rates	Min – Max
Disability Evaluation Analyst	\$3,749 – \$4,698 (Rg. A) \$4,059 – \$5,081 (Rg. B) \$4,868 – \$6,093 (Rg. C)
Disability Evaluation Analyst II	\$5,334 – \$6,680
Disability Evaluation Analyst III	\$5,885 – \$7,327

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancies for the Disability Evaluation Analyst series:

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Disability Evaluation Analyst	29.4%
Disability Evaluation Analyst II	N/A
Disability Evaluation Analyst III	20%

Vacancy rates vary by classification; however, both the Disability Evaluation Analyst and Disability Evaluation Analyst III are both greater than the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate. The classification trends demonstrate a lower voluntary separation rate over the overall bargaining unit at 2.3% compared to the 2.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average. Employer data also shows the Disability Evaluation Analyst III maintains a marginally higher 3-year average Retirement rate of 4.0% percent compared to the Bargaining Unit 1 3-year average rate of 2.8% percent. The Disability Evaluation Analyst III carries a 6.4% average turnover rate, which is higher than the 5.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average.

The Disability Evaluation Analyst series time in service:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Disability Evaluation Analyst	6 years
Disability Evaluation Analyst III	15 years

The Disability Evaluation Analyst classification's average time in civil service is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Unit 1 employee population; however, the Disability Evaluation Analyst III average time in civil service exceeds the Bargaining Unit 1 population. Based on the classification's salary structure, a Disability Evaluation Analyst who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 9 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification. The Disability Evaluation Analyst III will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report this occupational group receives approximately 3.4% less than local government, 27.5% more than private, and lags the Federal government by 3.6%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 5.8% less than local government, 35.1% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 3.5%.

Issues:

While the Disability Determination Services Division can recruit new Disability Evaluation Analysts, the high-paced work environment has resulted in an inability to retain staff. For example, the last five (5) Disability Evaluation Analyst training classes in the Central Valley branch have an average retention rate of 50%.

The Disability Determination Services Division experiences a high rate of turnover. Retention rates average can be as high as 50% based on office location.

Central Valley Branch Training Class	Number of Trainees	Remaining as of November 2024	Retention Rate
Spring 2021	8	3	37.5%
Fall 2021	9	5	55.5%
Summer 2022	5	4	80.0%
Fall 2022	5	1	20.0%
Spring 2023	7	4	57.1%
TOTAL	34	17	50.0%

The impact of low retention rates is less experienced Disability Evaluation Analysts, quality issues due to that lack of experience, increased workloads, job burnout, and decreased morale.

Another contributor is the comparable low wage rate for the classification. Similar types of occupations offer higher salaries. Further, limited upward mobility influences recruitment and retention into the classification. There are only two classifications for the Disability Evaluation Analyst I and III. The rank and file upward mobility opportunity is to move from the Case Adjudication Bureau to either the Operations Bureau or the Program Support Bureau. However, these are lateral moves which offer increased responsibilities but no increase in salary.

Recommendations:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Explore expansion of pay ranges to provide retention incentives.

Field Examiner, Agricultural Labor Relations Board Series

Series Description:

The Field Examiner classification series is involved in compliance with the Agricultural Labor Relations laws and improved relations among workers, employers, and labor groups by supervision of unit determination elections, mediation of disputes and investigation of allegations of unfair labor practice.

Series Composition:

The series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Field Examiner I, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	WR60	9518
Field Examiner II, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	WR55	9519
Field Examiner III, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	WR50	9520

The Field Examiner series is grouped under Social Security and Rehabilitation Services, Employment Relations, which covers:

Schematic Group	Schematic Code
Field Representation	WO05
Apprenticeship Standards	WO10
Labor Law Enforcement	WQ00
Fair Employment Practices	WR00
Conciliation	WS00

Salary Rates	Min - Max
Field Examiner I, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	\$3,749 – \$4,698 (Rg. A)
	\$4,868 – \$6,093 (Rg. B)
Field Examiner II, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	\$5,855 – \$7,327
Field Examiner III, Agricultural Labor Relations Board	\$6,430 – \$8,049

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancies for the Field Examiner Series:

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Field Examiner I, ALRB	20%
Field Examiner II, ALRB	N/A
Bargaining Unit 1	16.4%

The Field Examiner I, ALRB demonstrate a higher voluntary separation rate at 6.7% compared to the Bargaining Unit 1 2.5% average.

The Field Examiner, ALRB series time in service:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Field Examiner I, ALRB	6 years
Field Examiner II, ALRB	9 years

The Field Examiner I and II classification's average time in civil service is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, a Field Examiner I who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 9 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification. The Field Examiner II will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

Issues:

Field Examiners have not received a special salary adjustment; however, they have received compensation increases. The Field Examiner I compensation is equivalent to the Staff Services Analyst classification, which is the exam ALRB uses as an appropriate list. The classification specification has not been modified since 1976. Further, Field Examiner I and II perform similar job duties. The field examiner primary role is to investigate Unfair Labor Practices and both Field Examiner I and II handle cases from beginning to end. Lastly, limited career opportunities, job duties and work hours for Field Examiner(s) results in high turnover for the classification series.

Recommendations:

Continue efforts to consolidate Field Examiner I and II into the proposed generalist/analyst series.

Review duties to determine if the stated scope of work is appropriate and in line with current duties.

Health Program Auditor, Department of Health Care Services Series

Series Description:

The Health Program Auditor series specification describes classes used in the Department of Health Care Services (DHCS). These classes perform, supervise, and manage professional auditing work to assure compliance with the Federal and State laws and regulations governing the various health programs. These classes also preside at informal and formal administrative hearings resulting from audits, investigations and medical reviews, involving financial assessments and settlement grievances between health programs administered by various departments and contract providers of services. Health Program Auditors also provide expert testimony during informal and formal hearing to support any findings during review.

Positions in the Health Program Auditor series administers, supervises, manage or conduct management of financial and internal audits and investigations of hospitals, nursing homes, prepaid health plans, adult day health centers, organized health systems, pilot projects, family planning clinics, rural and Indian health clinics, departmental programs, site mitigation and other contractors and fiscal intermediaries; perform special and complex reviews of health care maintenance organizations; determine and obtain compliance with Federal and State laws and regulations governing various program contractors, preventive health programs and Medi-Cal reimbursements; conduct informal and formal appeal hearings including controlling the course of the hearing, reviewing evidence in written form, examining testimony, and preparing reports of findings and recommending proposed decisions; serve in a staff or supervisory capacity to develop and interpret audit and compliance procedures and review and analyze the fiscal and program impact of pending legislation on the Department's various health programs; and provide expert testimony at hearings related to disputed audit findings.

Health Program Auditor is a critical classification tasked with protecting and enhancing the integrity of the health programs administered by DHCS, as required by Federal regulations. Thereby ensuring State and Federal health care funding is used appropriately to provide for the health and well-being of the public at large. Health Program Auditors work in the various divisions in the Audits & Investigations of DHCS, as well as the DHCS Office of Administrative Hearings and Appeals, and DHCS Office of Compliance. Each division has Health Program Auditor's that are specialized in auditing specific types of programs. Each program is unique and has specific compliance and reimbursement per applicable regulations for a specific Medi-Cal program.

The Health Program Auditor series is unique in the fact that the Department of Health Care Services typically relies on internal growth. The dependent relation between the Health

Program Auditor classifications means that recruitment issues at the entry level affect all classifications.

Series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Health Program Auditor II, DHCS	JF20	4254
Health Program Auditor III, DHCS	JF18	4252
Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS	JF16	4249
Health Program Audit Mgr. I, DHCS	JF14	4247
Health Program Audit Mgr. II, DHCS	JF12	4248
Health Program Audit Mgr. III, DHCS	JF10	4257

Series Composition:

The Health Program Auditor is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Financial, which covers:

Schematic Group	Schematic Code
General Auditing and Financial Examinations	JA00
Public Utility Rates and Examinations	JG00
Tax Administration and Auditing	JH00
State Controller's Office	JK00
Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control	JL00
Specialized Financial Staff Services	JR00
Financial Planning and Investments	JV00

The current salary ranges are:

Classification	Min-Max
Health Program Auditor II, DHCS	\$5,367 – \$7,057
Health Program Auditor III, DHCS	\$6,452 – \$8,485
Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS	\$6,752 – \$8,876
Health Program Audit Mgr. I, DHCS	\$7,354 – \$9,598
Health Program Audit Mgr. II, DHCS	\$8,077 – \$10,538
Health Program Audit Mgr. III, DHCS	\$9,819 – \$11,712

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancy rates for the Health Program Auditor, DHCS series:

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Health Program Auditor II, DHCS	20.6%
Health Program Auditor III, DHCS	11.5%
Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS	11.8%

Vacancy rates vary by classification; however, both the Health Program Auditor III and IV, DHCS, are both below the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate, while the Health Program Auditor II, DHCS is above.

The classification voluntary separation rates:

Classification	Voluntary Separation Rate
Health Program Auditor II, DHCS	9.9%
Health Program Auditor III, DHCS	3.0%
Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS	1.9%

The voluntary separation rates exceed the overall Bargaining Unit 1 2.5% versus the Health Program Auditor II and III, DHCS; however, the Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS voluntary separation rate is below the bargaining unit average. The Health Program Auditor II, DHCS carries a 9.2% average turnover rate, which is higher than the 5.5% bargaining unit average.

The Health Program Auditor, DHCS series time in service:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Health Program Auditor II, DHCS	6 years
Health Program Auditor III, DHCS	15 years
Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS	24 years

Overall, the Health Program Auditor classification's average time in civil service exceeds the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, a Health Program Auditor II, DHCS who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification. The Health Program Auditor III, DHCS will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification, while the Health Program Auditor IV, DHCS will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report this occupational group receives approximately 6% less than local government, 8% more than private, and lags the Federal government by 23.3%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 2.9% more than local government, 13.7% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 19.5%.

Issues:

A barrier to recruiting staff is the low entry level salary. Hiring teams have trouble recruiting qualified Auditors I's, as the low salary makes the classification unappealing to those who have just received their bachelor's degree. The Auditor I classification is often utilized as a feeder class to the Health Program Auditor series.

Health Program Auditors lateral transfer to other classifications with other departments. The Department of Financial Protection and Innovation is an example of a department that regularly attracts Health Program Auditor IIIs. Health Program Auditor IIIs will make a lateral transfer as a Financial Institutions Examiner. The Department of Managed Health Care is another department Health Program Auditors are leaving to for higher salary as Corporation Examiners.

The move from State service to Federal and certain local agencies in high cost living areas is a direct result of the drastically higher pay that these entities offer. To further emphasize the desirability regarding working with federal agencies, federal employers provide a broader range of step increases and locality pay. In this case, Federal agencies exceed total compensation offered by the State in relation to both salary and benefits.

The high vacancy rate of an Auditor I directly affects all Health Program Auditors as it creates a bottleneck effect to gaining new Health Program Auditors IIIs. To advance to a Health Program Auditor II at DHCS, an employee must first serve as an Auditor I for at least one year. Although the vacancy rate is primarily high in the Health Program Auditor II class, this affects the entire series because they are the feeder class to Health Program Auditor IIIs.

Health Program Auditor IIIs are conducting more special projects and complex audits as there is a lack of Health Program Auditor IV positions. Health Program Auditor III will often leave for occupations with more competitive salaries as soon as they have gained years of experience.

While Health Program Auditor IV is the most advanced classification in this rank-and-file series, it is not compensated at an equivalent salary compared to other senior level state classifications. Health Program Auditor IVs conduct direct continuing training and special projects as there have been numerous changes in the industry. Health Program Auditor IVs often function as a backup supervisor when it is necessary. Furthermore, the salary of a Health Program Auditor IV is lower than equivalent senior staff, such as the Senior Institutions Examiner in the Department of Financial Protection and Innovation. This further encourages senior staff to leave for promotional opportunities and career advancement.

Recommendation:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Review Health Program Auditor II, DHCS minimum salary for potential Special Salary Adjustment.

Expand training opportunities.

Hearing Reporter

Series Description:

The Hearing Reporter classification series, primarily utilized by the Department of Industrial Relations (DIR) in the Division of Worker's Compensation (DWC), was established to, under direction, record in shorthand or machine shorthand writing and transcribe verbatim accounts of proceedings, hearings, and other meetings; and to do other related work.

The Hearing Reporter takes verbatim accounts of conferences, hearings, proceedings, trials, and other formal or informal meetings in shorthand or machine shorthand writing; properly identifies speakers and notes the introduction of exhibits and other matters; takes depositions and the testimony of witnesses on a variety of subject matter within a number of fields of work; transcribes notes on a typewriter or re-dictates on dictating equipment for transcription by a transcriber; frequently working to meet fixed deadlines, prepares a complete transcript of evidence and testimony; frequently travels to various locations to record proceedings and hearings; appears before quasi-judicial bodies or other formal groups to read shorthand notes; takes and transcribes dictated summaries of minutes of meetings, and performs incidental related clerical and stenographic work.

Series Composition:

This series is comprised of one classification:

	Schem Code	Class Code
Hearing Reporter	CD20	1229

The Hearing Reporter classification is grouped under Office and Allied Services, which covers:

Schematic Group	Group Identifier
GENERAL	CA00
TYPING	CC00
STENOGRAPHY AND SECRETARIAL	CD00
LEGISLATIVE	CF00
PAYROLL	CG05
PERSONNEL-CLERICAL	CG40
Salary	Min - Max
Hearing Reporter	\$7,001 – \$8,760

To meet the minimum qualifications to serve in a Hearing Reporter position, and individual must either:

- Have one year of experience taking and transcribing verbatim accounts of conferences, hearings, proceedings, trials, and other formal meetings in shorthand or machine shorthand writing; or
- Possess a State of California License as a Certified Shorthand Reporter; or
- Possess a Certificate of Proficiency or a Certificate of Merit issued by the National Shorthand Reporters' Association (NSRA). (Completion of eighteen months of full-time study at a school specializing in Hearing Reporter training may be substituted for not more than half of the required experience under Pattern I.)

Historically, incumbents have met the minimum qualification through possession of a State of California License as a Certified Shorthand Reporter.

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancy rate stands at 22.1%. This is above the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate. The classification trends demonstrate a higher voluntary separation rate at 3.1% compared to the 2.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average. Employer data also shows the Hearing Reporter has a higher 3-year average Retirement rate of 6.7% percent compared to the Bargaining Unit 1 overall 3-year average rate of 2.8% percent. The average turnover rate has dropped from 9.4% in 2023 to 3.1% in 2024, which is lower than the 5.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average.

The Hearing Reporter classification's average time in civil service is approximately 14 years, which is above the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, a Hearing Reporter who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

Issues:

Compensation for Hearing Reporters is below similar positions in other government sectors. There are more reporters retiring each year than entering the field. The small number of new reporters entering the field go to the County Superior Courts because of the higher pay and bonuses or become deposition reporters to work remotely, leaving State Hearing Reporter positions unfilled. Therefore, the State Hearing Reporter position is shrinking each year, down to 63 reporters today. Consistent with the nationwide issue of court reporter shortages, more Hearing Reporters retire each year than enter the field.

Other government Hearing Reporter positions (i.e. county, city) are hired at a higher rate than state employment, offering hiring bonuses attached to their compensation with the provision that the employee stays onboard for one year.

Recommendation:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Consider retention related compensation to retain experience.

Investigative Auditor Series

Series Description:

This series specification describes classes used in several programs within the Department of Justice (DOJ). Incumbents in these classes, working in conjunction with Deputy Attorneys General and Special Agents, planning, organizing and direct statewide auditing and investigative activities. Duties include the performance of technical and administrative tasks according to generally accepted accounting practices and procedures to assure compliance with complex State and Federal laws and regulations under the enforcement or supervisory jurisdiction of the Attorney General.

Investigative audits for the DOJ include review of: chemical manufacturers and distribution companies; operations of charitable trusts; assets obtained through illegal drug trafficking or fraudulent activities; corporations, financial institutions and other business entities used for fraudulent or white collar criminal activities; legitimate institutions used for laundering illegal proceeds from drug or fraudulent activities; medical practitioners, providers, clinics and facilities who commit Medi-Cal Fraud, patient abuse and drug diversion violations and any other activity designed to circumvent the law. Investigative audits in the above areas frequently result in criminal and/or civil prosecution.

Entry into this series is typically through the class of Auditor I.

Series Composition:

This series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Investigative Auditor II, DOJ	JE26	4203
Investigative Auditor III, DOJ	JE24	4215
Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ	JE22	4224
Investigative Auditor IV (Supervisor), DOJ	JE20	4226
Salary Rates	Min – Max	
Investigative Auditor II, DOJ	\$5,367 – \$7,057	
Investigative Auditor III, DOJ	\$6,452 – \$8,458	
Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ	\$6,752 – \$8,876	
Investigative Auditor IV (Supervisor), DOJ	\$7,311 – \$9,537	

The Investigative Auditor series is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, which covers:

Schematic Group	Group Identifier
General Auditing and Financial Examinations	JA00
Public Utility Rates and Examinations	JG00
Tax Administration and Auditing	JH00
State Controller's Office	JK00
Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control	JL00
Specialized Financial Staff Services	JR00

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancies for the Investigative Auditor, DOJ series:

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Investigative Auditor II, DOJ	100%
Investigative Auditor III, DOJ	22.3%
Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ	43.9%

Vacancy rates vary by classification; however, the vacancies rates for the series are above the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate.

The classification voluntary separation rates:

Classification	Voluntary Separation Rate
Investigative Auditor II, DOJ	N/A
Investigative Auditor III, DOJ	4.3%
Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ	N/A

The voluntary separation rates exceed the overall Bargaining Unit 1 2.5% average.

The Investigative Auditor, DOJ series time in service:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Investigative Auditor II, DOJ	4 years
Investigative Auditor III, DOJ	12 years
Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ	24 years
Bargaining Unit Average	13 years

Based on the classification's salary structure, an Investigative Auditor II, DOJ who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification. The Investigative Auditor III, DOJ will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification, while the Investigative Auditor IV (Specialist), DOJ will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report this occupational group receives approximately 4.6% more than local government, 8% more than private sector, and lags the Federal government by 23.3%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 2.9% more than local government, 3.7% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 19.5%, indicating positive salary growth overall.

Issues:

Since the inception of the Investigative Auditor (IA) classification series, established March 1990, the duties for the IAs have evolved with the changing duties and responsibilities of the workload. While the minimum qualifications for the IA series include participating in criminal or civil field investigations, the duties for the current IA series have evolved to independently conduct criminal, civil, and administrative investigations. This includes solely preparing search warrants, serving them to the judge, and being fully responsible and liable for contents within.

The qualifications and responsibilities for the IA series have also increased to include the following core duties:

- Knowledge and accountability of Law Enforcement chain of custody for evidence and Peace Officer Hearsay Testimony certification, as required by Proposition 115.
- IAs may also act as the primary lead investigator for Anti-Money Laundering Criminal Investigations and violations of the Federal Bank Secrecy Act.
- Prepare and may serve-search warrants or engagements outside of standard work hours to adhere to personnel safety requirements.
- Maintain and enforce the state's asset forfeiture program.
- Within the DOJ's Division of Law Enforcement (DLE), IAs may frequently work in the field to conduct interviews, interrogate suspects, serve search warrants, and testify at court proceedings.
- Complete required Arrest and Firearms training in accordance with P.C. 832, every three years. The training is a mandatory 40-hour course, which includes both lecture and physical evaluation.
- Serve as Primary Lead Financial Investigator for various criminal prosecutions for the duration of the case.

Subsequently, the duties and responsibilities have changed since classification inception from an office centric assistant investigative auditing support role to now a fully independent lead field investigator with extensive and complex auditing responsibilities.

In addition, as presented by the subject matter expert through separation letters, some previous IAs explained their reason for leaving their DOJ position was to transfer to other state auditing classifications, which offer the same pay, better upward mobility, less responsibilities in the criminal field, and less time in the field. Other previous IAs left their DOJ position to pursue the private or federal sector where the pay is significantly higher as auditors with investigative skills are often in demand at federal agencies, such as the Internal Revenue Service or other large private auditing firms.

In 2024, the IA II classification has a 100% vacancy rate. This high vacancy rate means there are fewer potential replacements-and individuals with the mandatory required experience and knowledge, to be promoted to IA IIIs and IVs. In fact, IA IIIs are at a 22.3% vacancy rate and the IA IVs are at a 43.9% vacancy rate, both which are well above the Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate.

Recommendation:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Review additional recruitment and retention incentives to recognize increased skill and/or knowledge/certifications that may be needed for position.

Continue review of Classification Specification with a focus on properly capturing current duties performed and reducing outdated education based recruitment barriers.

Explore training opportunities for the IA series.

Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Specialist)

Series Description:

This series specification describes the Mineral and Land Auditor classifications of the California State Lands Commission. These positions are used for professional, supervisory, or managerial responsibilities in the California State Lands Commission Mineral and Land Audit Program.

Mineral and Land Auditor Specialists make field audits of the financial operations, accounts, records, data processing systems, management, and operational systems of the lessees (petroleum, geothermal, mineral, and surface) of the California State Lands Commission. In addition, the Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Supervisory) supervises, plans, and evaluates the work of other Mineral and Land Auditor Specialists.

California State Lands Commission Auditors (both General Auditor IIIs and Mineral and Land Auditor Specialists) conduct complex audits of oil, gas, mineral, and commercial leases to validate monthly royalty payments to the State, and examine lessees' financial data, production operations, and records, with an additional focus on contract or lease term compliance and commission policy. Since 2013, California State Lands Commission auditors have successfully recovered a total of \$13.7 million in findings. These findings are the result of the comprehensive financial audits performed on the State's numerous oil and gas, geothermal, minerals (trona, gravel, sand, rocks), and rare metals (gold/silver) leases.

Series Composition:

This series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Specialist)	JE42	4137
Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Supervisory)	JE44	4115

The Mineral and Land Auditor series is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, which covers:

Schematic Group	Group Identifier
General Auditing and Financial Examinations	JA00
Public Utility Rates and Examinations	JG00
Tax Administration and Auditing	JH00
State Controller's Office	JK00
Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control	JL00
Specialized Financial Staff Services	JR00

Salary Rates

Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Specialist)
Mineral and Land Auditor Specialist IV (Supervisory)

Min – Max

\$6,738 – \$8,862
\$6,940 – \$9,126

Position Information and Employment Data:

In 2024, the Mineral and Land Auditor IV (Specialist) had two established positions statewide, both of which are vacant. There is no voluntary separation data for this classification over the last five years. Employer data also shows the classification has a higher 3-year average Retirement rate of 0% percent compared to the overall Bargaining Unit 1 3-year average rate of 2.8% percent. The average turnover rate is 50%, which is higher than the 5.5% Bargaining Unit 1 average.

The Mineral and Land Auditor IV (Specialist) classification's average time in civil service is approximately nine years, which is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population. Based on the classification's salary structure, a Mineral and Land Auditor IV (Specialist) who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 6 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

According to the State's 2021 Total Compensation Report this occupational group receives approximately 4.6% more than local government, 8% more than private, and lags the Federal government by 23.3%. According to the State's 2018 Total Compensation Report, this occupational group received approximately 2.9% more than local government, 3.7% more than private sector, and lagged the Federal government by 19.5%, indicating positive salary growth overall.

Issue:

The California State Lands Commission discontinued the use of the Mineral and Land Auditor II and III classifications and reclassified to the service wide General Auditor classifications. Subsequently, Mineral and Land Auditor II and III classifications were abolished in accordance with California Code of Regulations, title 2, section 90. The California State Lands Commission continued to use the Mineral and Land Auditor IV (Specialist) classification due to having incumbents in the positions. The California State Lands Commission has several General Auditor III positions filled and incumbents in this classification can act as lead-person and work on specialized and more complex audit work. The California State Lands Commission does not have a current need to fill a Mineral and Land Auditor IV position.

Recommendation:

Explore opportunities to include the General Auditor II and III classification in the CalHR Total Compensation Study and Report.

Review for possible additional incentives such as geographical pay for higher cost of living for the Mineral and Land Auditor IV (Specialist) and/or General Auditor II and III classifications.

Research Data Series

Series Description:

This Research Data series specification describes professional research data classifications responsible for planning, organizing, and conducting studies in a variety of areas, which affect programs or systems development. Incumbents in these classifications perform quantitative and qualitative data-driven research and statistical analysis. The term research as applied to this classification series is defined as a systematic, critical, quantitative and qualitative analytical approach to data collection and querying, mining and manipulation, data quality determination, and intensive investigation directed toward either a more comprehensive knowledge of the subject or for use in the resolution and operational improvement of program-related issues. Incumbents in this series gather, compile, populate, edit, and interpret structured and unstructured data, or they create, implement, troubleshoot and monitor data reporting tools, simulation models, and procedures to assemble and structure the necessary data. Incumbents present findings in a user-friendly format, such as tabulated, charts, or dashboards, make comparisons with similar or historical data, and/or discuss the findings in writing. Incumbents provide expert consultative services on the feasibility, impact, or potential impact on a variety of state operations, projects, or proposals to interested parties. Incumbents advise management, departmental staff, legislative bodies, governmental entities, commissions, and agencies on findings related to the assigned area of research.

Supervisors and managers in this series are responsible for leadership of a distinct research, statistical, or data analytics segment of a department. Incumbents may plan operations, develop staffing requirements, organize and direct the work of a group of employees, and evaluate their work. Incumbents are required to perform any combination of general management and research data analytic duties. These classifications require an overall comprehension of management, data analysis and modeling, research methodology, and statistical procedures, along with the ability to manage analysts, and to query, validate, and synthesize data from a variety of disciplines.

Series Composition:

This series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Research Data Analyst I	LQ20	5729
Research Data Analyst II	LQ10	5731
Research Data Specialist I	LQ80	5742
Research Data Specialist II	LQ70	5758
Research Data Specialist III	LQ67	5770

Research Data Supervisor I	LQ50	5734
Research Data Supervisor II	LQ40	5737
Research Data Manager	LQ30	5740

The Research Data series is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Actuarial, Research, and Statistics, which covers:

Schematic Group	Group Identifier
Actuarial	LP00
General Research	LQ00
Research Science	LS00
Public Utilities Research	LT00
Social Research and Related	LU00
Statistics	LX18

Salary Rates	Min – Max
Research Data Analyst I	
(Rg. A)	\$4,339 – \$4,931
(Rg. B)	\$4,477 – \$5,335
(Rg. C)	\$5,368 – \$6,720
(Rg. L)	\$4,469 – \$5,079
(Rg. M)	\$4,612 – \$5,494
(Rg. N)	\$5,528 – \$6,922
Research Data Analyst II	
(Rg. A)	\$6,453 – \$8,083
(Rg. L)	\$6,647 – \$8,323
Research Data Specialist I	
(Rg. A)	\$6,752 – \$8,452
(Rg. L)	\$6,956 – \$8,709
Research Data Specialist II	
(Rg. A)	\$7,417 – \$9,283
(Rg. L)	\$7,640 – \$9,560
Research Data Specialist III	
(Rg. A)	\$8,148 – \$10,199
(Rg. L)	\$8,392 – \$10,505

Research Data Supervisor I	\$7,311 – \$9,083
Research Data Supervisor II	\$8,025 – \$9,970
Research Data Manager	\$9,757 – \$11,078

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancies for the Research Data Series (suggest adding date and overall vacancy rate):

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Research Data Analyst I	22.5%
Research Data Analyst II	20.5%
Research Data Specialist I	22.1%
Research Data Specialist II	21.3%
Research Data Specialist III	20.5%

Vacancy rates vary by classification; however, the entire series vacancy rates are greater than the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate.

Voluntary separation rates for each Research Data classification as follows:

Classification	Voluntary Separation Rate
Research Data Analyst I	3.3%
Research Data Analyst II	4.2%
Research Data Specialist I	4.1%
Research Data Specialist II	2.6%
Research Data Specialist III	N/A

The classification trends demonstrate a higher voluntary separation rate at each level when compared to the Bargaining Unit 1 2.5% average.

The Research Data series average time in service is as follows:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Research Data Analyst I	6 years
Research Data Analyst II	10 years
Research Data Specialist I	9 years
Research Data Specialist II	12 years

Research Data Specialist III	14 years
------------------------------	----------

The Research Data series average time in civil service is below the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population except at the Research Data Specialist III level.

Issues:

Vacancy and separation rates suggest some departments may have issues recruiting and retaining employees in the Research Data series.

Other public employers, such as the Federal government, may pay more for Research Data skills compared to the State of California.

Recommendation:

CalHR will explore opportunities to include the Research Data classification series in the CalHR Total Compensation Study and Report.

Consider providing the Research Data classification series additional compensation to assist in addressing recruitment and retention concerns with the classification series.

Increase career development, training, and learning and development opportunities.

Review additional recruitment and retention incentives to recognize increased skill and/or knowledge/certifications that may be needed for the position.

Insurance Rate Analyst Series

Series Description:

The Insurance Rate Analyst series describes classes concerned with regulatory work to ensure compliance with the California Insurance Code and other insurance laws as related to insurance rating and underwriting issues. This series provides for four levels of technical, analytical, professional, and supervisory skills required to ensure the effective and efficient regulatory operation of the Department of Insurance. This includes the analysis, evaluation and determination regarding insurance rates, rating plans, classifications, and underwriting practices of insurance companies, rating and advisory organizations, and other groups and associations engaged in insurance ratemaking activities. Incumbents perform technical and analytical work to identify adherence to insurance laws by insurance providers regarding rating and underwriting; conduct examinations of the application and interpretation of rates, policy forms, rating guidelines, and underwriting practices to determine if insurers are fulfilling their legal obligations, evaluate rate filing applications and supporting documentation, and analyses to determine rate adequacy and compliance with rating and underwriting laws; and initiate corrective or enforcement actions for non-compliant insurance organizations.

Senior Insurance Rate Analyst Job Duties:

This is the advanced journey and team leader level of the series. Under direction, incumbents act as technical expert and perform complex analyses, evaluations, and determinations regarding the insurance rates, rating plans, classifications, and underwriting practices; lead examination and analysis of the rating and underwriting methodologies and practices of the largest, most complex insurance companies, rating organizations, and other entities engaged in insurance ratemaking activities; direct and train a small staff in this work; review data on which rates are based, evaluate this data, and analyze the formulae and rating plan or system used in formulation of rates; review policy forms and endorsements for compliance with insurance-related law; make investigations of complaints regarding insurance rates and rating practices; evaluate factors involved in the formulation of rates, such as premium, loss, and expense experience or projections, risk characteristics, and judgment factors; and prepare correspondence, reports on findings, conclusions, and recommendations, and legal referrals to resolve issues identified with noncompliant insurers.

Series Composition:

The series is comprised of:

Classification	Schem Code	Class Code
Insurance Rate Analyst	JC40	4441
Associate Insurance Rate Analyst	JC38	4438
Senior Insurance Rate Analyst	JC34	4435
Supervising Insurance Rate Analyst	JC32	4432

The Insurance Rate Analyst series is grouped under Fiscal, Management and Staff Services, Financial, which covers:

Schematic Group

General Auditing and Financial Examinations
 Public Utility Rates and Examinations
 Tax Administration and Auditing
 State Controller's Office
 Accounting and Departmental Fiscal Control
 Specialized Financial Staff Services
 Financial Planning and Investments

Schematic Code

JA00
 JG00
 JH00
 JK00
 JL00
 JR00
 JV00

Salary Rates

Insurance Rate Analyst

Min – Max

\$4,449 – \$5,053 (A)
 \$4,590 – \$5,467 (B)
 \$5,501 – \$6,887 (C)
 \$5,741 – \$7,188 (D)

Associate Insurance Rate Analyst

\$6,614 – \$8,286 (A)
 \$6,921 – \$8,662 (B)

Senior Insurance Rate Analyst

\$7,603 – \$9,516 (A)
 \$8,351 – \$10,452 (B)

Supervising Insurance Rate Analyst

\$8,822.00 - \$10,977.00

Position Information and Employment Data:

The 2024 vacancy rates for the Insurance Rate Analyst series:

Classification	Vacancy Rate
Insurance Rate Analyst	5.9%
Associate Insurance Rate Analyst	8.6%
Senior Insurance Rate Analyst	0%

Vacancy rates vary by classification; however, the vacancies rates for the series are all below the 16.4% overall Bargaining Unit 1 vacancy rate.

The classification voluntary separation rates:

Classification	Voluntary Separation Rate
Insurance Rate Analyst	6.2%
Associate Insurance Rate Analyst	N/A
Senior Insurance Rate Analyst	N/A

The voluntary separation rate at the Insurance Rate Analyst classification exceeds the overall Bargaining Unit 1 2.5% average. Additionally, the Senior Insurance Rate Analyst has a 3.7% turnover rate, as well as a 3.7% retirement rate, which exceeds the 2.5% turnover rate and 2.8% retirement rate for Bargaining Unit 1.

The Insurance Rate Analyst series time in service:

Classification	Average Time in Civil Service
Insurance Rate Analyst	4 years
Associate Insurance Rate Analyst	15 years
Senior Insurance Rate Analyst	21 years

The classification series average time in civil service exceeds the average time in civil service of 13 years of the Bargaining Unit 1 employee population at the Associate Insurance Rate Analyst and the Senior Insurance Rate Analyst levels. Based on the classification's salary structure, an Insurance Rate Analyst who enters the classification at the minimum salary rate will take approximately 9 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification. The Associate Insurance Rate Analyst will take approximately 5 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification, while the Senior Insurance Rate Analyst will take approximately 6 years to reach the maximum salary rate of the classification.

Issues:

There is a lack of promotional opportunities for newer analysts due to their lack of technical skills, highlighting a lack of proper training. This is compounding recruitment and retention challenges for Senior Insurance Rate Analyst roles. For instance, a recent attempt to fill a Senior Insurance Rate Analyst position failed because none of the candidates met the necessary qualifications. Hiring simply to fill vacancies without addressing training gaps undermines the work of senior analysts. As more experienced Senior Insurance Rate Analysts retire or leave for private sector roles, the department's inability to manage filings and address the insurance crisis will continue.

The current structure creates a bottleneck at the top levels. With eight (8) Supervising Insurance Rate Analyst positions available for all 24 Senior Insurance Rate Analysts, career advancement opportunities are limited. This issue also affects Insurance Rate Analysts and Associate Insurance Rate Analysts, as there are only 24 Senior Insurance Rate Analyst positions, which become available only when a Senior Insurance Rate Analyst retires or leaves. This lack of career progression contributes to frustration and low morale, making it increasingly difficult to retain and motivate staff at all levels.

Recommendation:

Consider providing a special salary adjustment based on a CalHR review of market rate salary comparisons to assist in addressing R&R concerns with the classification series.

Review additional recruitment and retention incentives to recognize increased skill and/or knowledge/certifications that may be needed for position.

Focus recruitment efforts on education backgrounds that properly fit position, such as statistics, actuarial science, and finance.

Expand training opportunities, including a focus on Actuarial Sciences, to remain up to date with industry standards.